

**Contract N°: IEE/11/845/SI2.616378**

***Bringing Europe and Third countries closer together  
through renewable Energies***

***BETTER***

***Minutes of the Stakeholder Consultation Workshop - North Africa  
28 October 2013, Rabat, Morocco***



***Project Coordinator: CIEMAT  
Coordination of the meeting: DLR  
Minutes taken by: Charikleia Karakosta (NTUA)***

***October 2013***



Co-funded by the Intelligent Energy Europe  
Programme of the European Union

Contract N°: IEE/11/845/SI2.616378

Project Acronym: BETTER

## Bringing Europe and Third countries closer together through renewable Energies

### ***Minutes of the Stakeholder Consultation Workshop – North Africa 28 October 2013, Rabat, Morocco***

*October 2013*

*Project Coordinator: **CIEMAT***

*Coordination of the meeting: **DLR***

*Minutes taken by: **Charikleia Karakosta (NTUA)***

*Disclaimer: The sole responsibility for the content of this report lies with the authors. It does not necessarily reflect the opinion of the European Union. Neither the EACI nor the European Commission are responsible for any use that may be made of the information contained therein.*

## ***INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW OF THE BETTER PROJECT***

**Abderrahim El Hafidi** (Director of Electricity and Renewable Energy, Ministry of Energy, Mines, Water and Environment - MEMEE), welcomes the attendees and provides a general overview of the Workshop. First of all, he notes that RES offer a real solution to energy problems, especially to the MENA region. Article 9 needs to be amended with political will, thus there is a need to design cooperation. He states that they are working in this direction to make Article 9 work, despite the difficulties they face. Moreover, he notes that what is proposed through Article 9 it's not a simple equation, as it involves many countries, but in spite of these problems they make considerable efforts. Finally, he wishes BETTER team full success in its work and concludes by saying a few words about the future of energy and proposing that we should act and take the decisions.

**Overview of the Workshop Program/ BETTER Project and its goals: Natalia Caldés (CIEMAT), BETTER project coordinator**, introduces the project and the program and thanks Abderrahim El Hafidi for highlighting the complexity of this instrument, as this is what BETTER tries to do.

**Stakeholders Engagement: Abdelghani El Gharras (OME)** presents the main goal of WP8 as well as the main activities and outcomes so far. He briefly presents the 3 main components of WP structure and methodology (Stakeholder Engagement; Creating Synergies with other Initiatives; Stakeholder Consultation). He also highlights the importance of the Stakeholder Associate Member as it brings about several advantages, as well as the strong involvement of stakeholders, especially from third countries, in the data collection and peer review of documents. Finally, he concludes with some open questions on how to deliver value to stakeholders. The main priority for stakeholders is to especially enable a clear regulatory framework, an Action Plan and recommendations.

**Conceptual and analytical framework to identify cooperation opportunities and barriers: Natalia Caldés (CIEMAT)** identifies 3 conditions within the conceptual framework (Macroeconomic and political benefits; Business Environment; Acceptance & Social willingness). She presents the regulatory and policy action loop and highlights that this conceptual framework will support the SWOT analysis.

Finally, she poses some questions for stakeholders and experts in the field in order to have a feedback and reminds the attendees that an email including the questionnaire will be sent at the end of today's meeting.

## ***BETTER PROJECT OUTPUTS AND FIRST RESULTS***

During the open discussion a fruitful dialog is held. **Tobias Fichter (DLR)** briefly presents WP3 and focuses on the aim of WP 3.1.1. & 3.1.4. Mr. Fichter provides several information about power plants in NA and briefly presents specific examples on them (Conventional power plants, Hydro power plants, Wind power sites and Solar power sites in Morocco). He continues with some information about grid capacity in NA, presenting again some examples. Finally, Mr. Fichter argues that the determination of a dedicated contact person in each NA partner country for data review is needed.

**Jürgen Kern (DLR)** presents the Prospects for RES-E in NA (Task 3.2). He claims that we are at the middle of the project so this is the best time to come to you. In addition, he analyzes briefly the demand development scenarios for Morocco, Algeria, Tunisia, Libya and Egypt. Moreover, he argues that there is a great need for feedback, opinions, comments and contributions about the consistency with regional targets and policy.

**Denis Hess (DLR)** presents a case for transmission of dispatchable solar energy from North Africa to Central Europe, how the infrastructure can be implemented and the relevant financial assessment of the project. Mr. Hess highlights the importance of citizens' involvement and proposes a way to include public participation in this study. Finally, he informs the attendance that all the related data will be uploaded.

## ***PANEL DISCUSSION***

### ***MODERATED BY NATALIA CALDÉS, CIEMAT***

**Natalia Caldés (CIEMAT)** starts the panel discussion with the reactions and the view on the progress of the project. She gives her opinion about some of the most relevant barriers at the moment.

**Ahmed Squalli (AMISOLE)** highlights a number of difficulties and refers to the regulatory /legal framework explaining how to support it. He gives particular emphasis on wind and solar plan projects.

**Taoufik Laabi (ONEE):** As for the export issue he suggests the study of a specific export case from a country to another. He argues that the legal framework for export exists and he proposes to work on these mechanisms in order to make them harmonized. On regional level, there is a need for national markets to harmonize rules. Furthermore, a global agreement is been discussed for equal treatment with the countries of Europe and points that one of the barriers is the cost of technologies. He wonders what is the difference between CSP and PV and which one is more economic. He mentions that Electricity system cannot work on such a high production and proposes the need to access neighbour grids. Finally, he suggests that a number of data should be updated taking into consideration the current context.

**Bennouna El Ghali (IRESEN)** argues that they support further research. Wind farm in Hassan reached the cheapest price of kWh in the history. He wonders if Industrial integration in Morocco was taken into consideration. He firmly believes that CSP can reach a high rate of integration in Morocco and suggests more focus on Industrial integration in Morocco and examination of which part industry could support this project and research in general.

**Dieter Uh (GIZ)** recommendation for the project is that more institutions from the NA side should be involved in the project. He believes that production rates in the NA countries will increase. Saudi Arabia turns to RES in order to save their resources. As for the climate change issue, the last report of the IPCC showed that the problem is going on, thus this is an issue that needs to be tackled. Moreover, he highlights the importance of CSP in the

German system and proposes a further study about the importance of CSP in the Moroccan system. Finally, he proposes a comparison between Dii scenario and the BETTER one as well as the comparison of results of different scenarios.

**Jürgen Kern (DLR)** gives a response to some remarks. He asks Mr. Squalli about the preference to CSP. He states that it was done from German point of view. He argues that now it is crucial to see the point of view from the exporter side. Of course, we will be glad to compare with industry initiatives. Lastly, he appreciates to have the industry.

**Natalia Caldés (CIEMAT)** says that Europe has to define post 2020 targets if we want Art9 to be implemented. Moreover, it is a barrier for Europe not to have post 2020 RES targets as this generates great uncertainty. Moreover, various MS are experiencing uncertainty and unexpected changes regarding their own political agenda. As for the contact with institutions, a good work has been done. Next, she mentions the technologies and stresses the differences between technologies. Modeling exercise is only a part of the study. She proposes to see the country capacity, the local content and combine all the factors.

According to **Dieter Uh (GIZ)**, national response of Spain to the Low carbon electricity is necessary and he suggests putting pressure on politicians.

**Taoufik Laabi (ONEE)** says that there is no integration of grids in Morocco so there is a need for enhancing this interconnection and to that direction, there is a dialogue with EU countries relating this. Interconnections should not be only for export of RES energy but also for import. Moreover, Mr. Laabi argues that Spain needs to reinforce these interconnections due to the economic crisis. Dialogue will enhance these res and energy in general.

**Ahmed Squalli (AMISOLE)** notes that it is better to see a big plan. Small decentralized projects are needed, so we have to think in a global scale. He states that the model is “Morocco – Germany” and more generally “NA – Europe” or even “Africa – Germany”.

**Natalia Caldés (CIEMAT)** says that these reality checks and SWOT analysis are necessary for this project.

**Ahmed Squalli (AMISOLE)** talks about the Project and the grid capacity. He argues that there are not only regulatory but also financial risks.

**Jürgen Kern (DLR)** thanks the attendees and declares that this is only one part of what is done in BETTER. He reminds the attendees what he has said about the Inventories and urges them to use them.

## ***CURRENT AND EXPECTED CONTRIBUTION OF RES-E IN NA COUNTRIES, AND THE POSSIBLE ROLE OF COOPERATION MECHANISMS***

**Dr. Dakkina** starts by saying that Morocco has embarked on an irreversible process of implementing the recommendations of the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development. Moreover, he says that Morocco has adopted a series of development strategies (The National Energy Strategy, The Morocco green plan, The 2020 Strategy for Rural Development, etc.). He continues by stating that the current policy of ADEERE aims to develop renewable energies and energy efficiency. As far as the energy sources are concerned, Dr. Dakkina mentions that Morocco has no fossil resources, 90% of the energy is imported (hydro electricity, oil, natural gas and coal). He says that RES play a crucial part in diversifying the energy mix and highlights that the potential of job creation must not be neglected. Moreover, he believes that RES should represent a major share of the energy consumption. Subsequently, he continues with a draft of the measures in order to present the national strategy. He refers to the Workshop which will be held on December and its purpose which is the adaptation of this national strategy. Finally Dr. Dakkina gives an overview of the laws related to energy and states that there is great potential for development and simultaneously environment protection.

**Noureddine Said (CDER)** presents the Energy consumption by sector and by source in Algeria. He focuses on CSP, PV and hydro- power, but as for wind energy, there is no wind potential. Algeria is the 1<sup>st</sup> country in MENA region on CSP economic potential. In addition, Said gives an overview of the projects. Finally, Said expresses their Intention to integrate BETTER in their projects.

**Enab Ismail Ameen (NREA)** talks about National Strategy up to 2020. He starts by saying that five policies have been approved to foster the increasing of RE energy contribution (Competitive Bids, Third Party Access, Feed-in-tariff, Net Metering, Quota System). Moreover, he states that there are considerations to increase the share of PV in Egypt. One of the challenges to the adopted concept is the time needed to develop the required infrastructure as well as mobilizing necessary investments. Finally, Enab Ismail Ameen explains what NREA has expectation from BETTER which is support to Egypt in order to implement its ambitious RE plans.

## ***FROM THEORY TO PRACTICE: HOW TO ENABLE A FRAMEWORK FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 9 - ROLE AND VIEW OF REGIONAL INITIATIVES IN THE NA REGION***

***MODERATED BY JÜRGEN KERN, DLR***

**Boris Schinke (German Watch)** talks about Climate change. He hopes that Energy transition in the above mentioned countries will continue to other countries as well. Moreover, Boris pinpoints some neglected points to BETTER project. In his opinion the project should be based on certain principals such as fairness (benefits from res should be shared equally to local people and MENA local capacities should be build up), trust (EU-MENA, engage a good dialogue, MENA should call EU for new climate targets because it will be affected from climate change impacts), participation (it is crucial the engagement of civil society in both regions, open up the dialogue, social acceptance bottleneck). Finally, he declares the importance of the spread of information about what has to be done for a sustainable future through media.

**Nabil Saimi (MASEN)** talks about Article 9 export from Morocco to EU. He elaborates which the directions and the lessons learnt are. He also states that there is technical potential and he wonders where the demand is. He wonders if this mechanism is durable and if there is a transition plan and he suggests a participatory approach. He highlights the importance of trust before the project starts. He suggests exploring the possibility of clear mission, clear vision, no obligation, no commitment and that they would like to see an obligation from EC, so as to be trusted. He emphasizes the goal which is to see a Mediterranean electricity/energy market. Finally, he highlights the importance of the participating approach.

**Boris Schinke (German Watch)** replies that now is about the Demand side so far. He states that this is the only project that combines different opinions.

**Nabil Saimi (MASEN)** his advice is to observe what has been done so far and build on that. Common understandable vision, specified objectives are important elements. The real objective has to be fixed and we do not have to expect everything from green energy. He continues by saying that more partners from the Mediterranean are needed.

**Jürgen Kern (DLR)** asks about what we can do in the BETTER project.

**Natalia Caldés (CIEMAT)**, it is important to identify the conditions under which Article 9 could be achieved. Mrs. Caldés pinpoints that the provision of recommendations and their translation into action plan is a very important added value of the project.

**Nabil Saimi (MASEN)** says that BETTER project is very important and feels that the study is too academical, thus a more pragmatic direction is needed. He believes that it is better to analyze one component in detail rather than do all.

**Natalia Caldés (CIEMAT)** asks the audience to mention, according to their knowledge and experience, what is the most important barrier of Article 9. She says that this feedback is of great help for the consortium.

**Nabil Saimi (MASEN)** highlights two things that we must not forget: (i) climate change never stops and (ii) geography does not move. . Of course, in his opinion, the time perspective is really important. Moreover, where the exports in the political agenda are and how we can move them up to the political agenda are two important issues as well.

**Tobias Fichter (DLR)** argues that EU needs partners from NA in order to achieve its goals.

**Natalia Caldés (CIEMAT)** says that a large European Stakeholder Workshop will take place in in Paris next year. She encourages the attendees to make use of BETTER project to have their voice heard in Europe.

**Radia Lahlou (CSP)** asks Mrs. Caldés if she has considered applying the conceptual framework presented to a specific RES project. This might be convenient for people.

**Natalia Caldés (CIEMAT)** replies the development of a specific project under Article 9 is not an outcome of this project per se, but would be a natural (and desirable) consequence of it. **MASEN** argues that strong action should be taken- things must go “from power point to power plants”.

**Natalia Caldés (CIEMAT)** states that one possible outcome of this project is that the additional accompanying measures to Article 9 will be identified

### ***WRAP-UP & SUMMARY (CIEMAT/ DLR)***

**N. Caldés** makes the conclusion of the meeting, thanking everybody (translators, GIZ, German government) and encourages everybody to work together. **J. Kern** thanks **N. Caldés** and all the attendees for making this project a small success.

## **ANNEXES**

## ANNEX A - AGENDA



# STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATION WORKSHOP - NORTH AFRICA

Bringing Europe and Third Countries Closer together  
through Renewable Energies

28<sup>th</sup> October, Rabat, Morocco



Co-funded by the Intelligent Energy Europe  
Programme of the European Union

8:30-9:00	<i>Welcome Coffee and Registration</i>	
<b>9:00-10:00</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW OF THE BETTER PROJECT</b>	
9:00-9:15	Welcome Speech & Opening	Abderrahim El Hafidi Ministry of Energy, Mines, Water and Environment (MEMEE)
	Overview of the Workshop Program	Natalia Caldés, (BETTER project coordinator/CIEMAT)
9:15-9:30	BETTER Project and its goals	Natalia Caldés (Project Coordinator/CIEMAT)
9:30-9:45	Stakeholders Engagement	Abdelghani El Gharras, WP8 leader (OME)
9:45-10:00	Conceptual and analytical framework to identify cooperation opportunities and barriers	Saskia Ellenbeck (PIK)
<b>10:00-12:15</b>	<b>BETTER PROJECT OUTPUTS AND FIRST RESULTS</b>	
10:00-10:45	The North Africa Case Study <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Inventory of RES-E in NA countries</li> <li>• Prospects for renewable energy expansion for the NA countries – bottom-up assessment</li> </ul>	Tobias Fichter (DLR) Jürgen Kern (DLR)
10:45-11:00	<i>Coffee Break</i>	
11:00-11:45	The North Africa Case Study (cont'd) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Transmission of dispatchable solar energy from North Africa to Central Europe</li> </ul>	Denis Hess (DLR)
11:45-12:15	Q&A session	
<b>12:15-13:00</b>	<b>PANEL DISCUSSION, Moderated by Natalia Caldés, CIEMAT</b>	
12:15-13:00	A panel discussion with selected stakeholders from the NA countries, as well as international experts, will be organized with the purpose to get their reactions and views on the work carried out by the consortium under the NA case study.	Ahmed Squalli, AMISOLE Taoufik Laabi, ONEE Badr Ikken, IRESEN Dieter Uh, GIZ

<b>13:00-14:00 Lunch</b>		
<b>14:00-17:15 Current and expected contribution of RES-E in NA countries, and the possible role of cooperation mechanisms</b>		
14:00-14:20	Presentation from Morocco	Abdelali Dakkina, ADEREE
14:20-14:40	Presentation from Algeria	Noureddine Said, CDER
14:40-15:00	Presentation from Egypt	Ehab Ismail Ameen, NREA
15:00-15:45	Q&A	
<b>15:45-16:00 Coffee Break</b>		
<b>16:00-17:00 From theory to practice: how to enable a framework for the implementation of Article 9 – Role and view of regional initiatives in the NA region, Moderated by Jürgen Kern, DLR</b>		
16:00-17:00	The main implications of the implementation of long-term cooperation mechanisms between EU and NA will be analysed and discussed by an Expert Panel bringing together representatives from NA countries as well as regional associations	Boris Schinke, German Watch Nabil Saimi, MASEN
<b>17:00-17:30 Wrap-Up &amp; Summary (CIEMAT/OME/DLR)</b>		

**Venue:**

Sala Panoramique  
 Hôtel la Tour Hassan Palace  
 26, Rue Chellah, B.P. 14, Rabat 10000, Morocco  
 +212 5372-39115 · [www.latourhassan.com](http://www.latourhassan.com)

**Hosted by:**



With kind support of the German  
 Ministry of Economics and Technology  
 (BMWi) within the German-Moroccan  
 Energy Partnership



BUSINESS.  
 GROWTH.  
 PROSPERITY.



## ANNEX B - LIST OF PARTICIPANTS



### STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATION WORKSHOP - NORTH AFRICA

Bringing Europe and Third Countries Closer together through Renewable Energies

28<sup>th</sup> October, Rabat, Morocco

## List of Participants

a/a	Full Name	Organisation	Country	Email
1	Abdelaaziz Khebbou	TEMASOL/AMISOLE	Morocco	<a href="mailto:Abdelaaziz.khebbou@sunpowercorp.com">Abdelaaziz.khebbou@sunpowercorp.com</a>
2	Abdelali Dakkina	ADEREE	Morocco	<a href="mailto:a.dakkina@aderee.ma">a.dakkina@aderee.ma</a> ; <a href="mailto:dakkina2002@yahoo.fr">dakkina2002@yahoo.fr</a>
3	Abdelghani El Gharras	OME	France	<a href="mailto:abdelghani.elgharras@ome.org">abdelghani.elgharras@ome.org</a>
4	Abderrahim El Hafidi	MEMWE	Morocco	<a href="mailto:a.elhafidi@mem.gov.ma">a.elhafidi@mem.gov.ma</a>
5	Ahmed Squalli	AMISOLE	Morocco	<a href="mailto:squalli@wanadoo.ma">squalli@wanadoo.ma</a>
6	Al-Sayed Ahmad	TERRANEX	Switzerland	<a href="mailto:ahmadysa@omantel.net.om">ahmadysa@omantel.net.om</a>
7	Badis Derradji	Acwa Power	Morocco	<a href="mailto:bderradji@acwapower.com">bderradji@acwapower.com</a>
8	Bemama Elghalli	IRESEN	Morocco	<a href="mailto:bemama@iresen.org">bemama@iresen.org</a>
9	Boris Schinke	German Watch	Germany	<a href="mailto:Schinke@Germanwatch.org">Schinke@Germanwatch.org</a>
10	Chara Karakosta	NTUA	Greece	<a href="mailto:chkara@epu.ntua.gr">chkara@epu.ntua.gr</a>
11	Chovkri Karim	MEMEE	Morocco	<a href="mailto:k.chovkri@mem.gov.ma">k.chovkri@mem.gov.ma</a>
12	Denis Hess	DLR	Germany	<a href="mailto:Denis.Hess@dlr.de">Denis.Hess@dlr.de</a>
13	Diebes leh	GIZ	Morocco	<a href="mailto:diebesleh@giz.de">diebesleh@giz.de</a>
14	Ehab Ismail Amin	NREA	Egypt	<a href="mailto:ehab7468@gmail.com">ehab7468@gmail.com</a>
15	Ghassane Aniba	EMI	Morocco	<a href="mailto:ghassane@emi.ac.ma">ghassane@emi.ac.ma</a>
16	Hasnae Bilil	EMI	Morocco	<a href="mailto:bilil@emi.ac.ma">bilil@emi.ac.ma</a>
17	Ilias Hamdouch	Masen	Morocco	<a href="mailto:hamdouch@masen.ma">hamdouch@masen.ma</a>
18	Imane Benyamna	GIZ	Morocco	<a href="mailto:benyamna.imane@gmail.com">benyamna.imane@gmail.com</a>

<b>a/a</b>	<b>Full Name</b>	<b>Organisation</b>	<b>Country</b>	<b>Email</b>
<b>19</b>	Jürgen Kern	DLR	Germany	<a href="mailto:Juergen.Kern@dlr.de">Juergen.Kern@dlr.de</a>
<b>20</b>	Katharina Hay	GIZ	Germany	<a href="mailto:katharina.hay@giz.de">katharina.hay@giz.de</a>
<b>21</b>	Larissa Wehning	GIZ	Germany	<a href="mailto:Larissa.Wehning@giz.de">Larissa.Wehning@giz.de</a>
<b>22</b>	Nabil Saimi	MASEN	Morocco	<a href="mailto:saimi@masen.ma">saimi@masen.ma</a>
<b>23</b>	Natalia Caldés	CIEMAT	Spain	<a href="mailto:natalia.caldes@ciemat.es">natalia.caldes@ciemat.es</a>
<b>24</b>	Noureddine Said	CDER	Algeria	<a href="mailto:nsaid@cder.dz">nsaid@cder.dz</a>
<b>25</b>	Radia Lahlou	CSP	Morocco	<a href="mailto:Radia.lahlou.1@gmail.com">Radia.lahlou.1@gmail.com</a>
<b>26</b>	Samir Lhaouki	ADEREE	Morocco	<a href="mailto:s.lhaouki@aderee.ma">s.lhaouki@aderee.ma</a>
<b>27</b>	Taoufik Laabi	ONEE	Morocco	<a href="mailto:laabi@onee.ma">laabi@onee.ma</a>
<b>28</b>	Tobias Fichter	DLR	Germany	<a href="mailto:Tobias.Fichter@dlr.de">Tobias.Fichter@dlr.de</a>
<b>29</b>	Youssef Afkir	GIZ	Morocco	<a href="mailto:y.afkir@avi.ma">y.afkir@avi.ma</a>